MEASURING SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

APPLICATION OF THE GENUINE PROGRESS INDEX
TO NOVA SCOTIA

THE ECONOMIC VALUE
CIVIC and VOLUNTARY WORK
In NOVA SCOTIA

UPDATE: February 11, 1999

Ronald Colman, Ph.D
GPIAtlantic
Halifax, Nova Scotia
1. Executive Summary 

(See Appendix for Charts and Tables)

New data from Statistics Canada reveal that volunteer services offered through community organizations declined by 7.2% in Nova Scotia and by 4.7% in Canada between 1987 and 1997. The decline is costing Nova Scotians $60 million and Canadians $1.83 billion annually in lost volunteer services. This loss is not counted in the GDP or in any of the conventional economic accounts.

The decline has occurred despite a substantial increase in the number of volunteers, because volunteers are offering an average of 25% fewer voluntary hours per person in Nova Scotia than they did 10 years ago. University graduates and married women, who both have particularly high rates of volunteer participation, are increasingly time crunched. Highly educated people are putting in more overtime hours in the paid economy, and many working married mothers are highly time stressed trying to juggle family and work responsibilities. These pressures are squeezing out voluntary work.

The volunteer rate among youth, 15-24 years old, almost doubled between 1987 and 1997, accounting for much of the increase in volunteer numbers. However, unlike older volunteers whose primary motivation is “helping others,” most young people say they are volunteering to increase their job opportunities, clearly a response to high youth unemployment rates in this period.

The decline in voluntary services has come at the same time as declining real incomes and cuts in government social services and income supports. The combined loss of government and voluntary social services and supports across Canada, excluding cuts to health and education, is estimated at 30% since 1993. Volunteer organizations and community-based agencies have been unable to meet the rising demand for services to the elderly, sick, disabled, youth, poor, and others at risk, partly as a result of significant cuts in public funding.

The new evidence challenges for the first time the prevailing assumption that voluntary groups and community-based agencies have absorbed and compensated for cuts in government services. Finance Minister Paul Martin has said: “There is no question that governments have to rely on volunteerism more than ever in a time of cut-backs”. In fact, the decline in voluntary services has compounded the cuts in government services, producing a substantial erosion of the social safety net, the standard of living and the quality of life of Canada’s most vulnerable groups.

The 1997 National Survey on Giving, Volunteering and Participating makes possible the first ever trend analysis of voluntary work in Canada. However it measures only formal voluntary work offered through organizations, whereas Nova Scotia and the Maritimes have particularly high rates of informal voluntary work. Later this year Statistics Canada will release the results of the 1998 General Social Survey that will allow, for the first time, an analysis of trends in both formal and informal voluntary work. GPI Atlantic has recommended an annual time use survey to track these vital trends in the voluntary sector on a more regular basis.

In July 1998, GPI Atlantic issued its first data release for the Nova Scotia Genuine Progress Index on the economic value of civic and voluntary work in the province. The report found that Nova Scotians voluntarily contribute an estimated 134 million hours a year of their time helping those in need, caring for their environment, and contributing to society at large and to their local communities. If this voluntary contribution were withdrawn, either our standard of living would decline dramatically, or the work would have to be replaced for pay.

If this voluntary work were replaced for pay in the government or private sectors it would be worth $1.75 billion a year to the economy, the equivalent of 81,000 jobs. In addition, volunteers pay out $128 million a year in non-reimbursed out-of-pocket expenses to perform their voluntary work. Altogether, the economic value of voluntary work amounts to 10% of the provincial GDP, or $2,500 for every adult Nova Scotian, but this work is not counted anywhere in our standard economic accounts.

On average, every adult Nova Scotian devotes about 3 hours and 23 minutes a week to civic and voluntary work, the highest rate in the country and well above the Canadian average of 2 hours and 40 minutes a week. One-third of adults in the province work for non-profit volunteer organizations, and three-quarters volunteer informally, visiting the sick, caring for the elderly, shopping and cooking for the disabled, providing unpaid child care for working mothers, and performing a variety of other social and civic services.

Nova Scotians also contribute about $100 million a year to charities, and volunteer organizations contribute to the formal economy indirectly by providing valuable skills training to workers. Surveys demonstrate that generosity and a desire to help others are the primary motivations for the vast majority of volunteers. In addition, the strong network of voluntary and community organizations provide the backbone of the civil society that is a primary guarantor of democratic values.

3. Warning Signals

The GPI report pointed out that while voluntary work is usually considered as individual acts of charity, it actually provides services of enormous economic and social value to the province which merit strong support if our standard of living and quality of life are to be maintained. At the same time, the report noted warning signals that the current strength of voluntary activity, a powerful existing asset to the province, could not be taken for granted.

In particular, the July report noted that time stress was increasing dramatically for the two groups that have traditionally had the highest participation rates in voluntary activity – university graduates and married women. Overtime hours in the market economy have increased most rapidly for university graduates. And married women, whose labour force
participation has doubled without a corresponding decrease in household work, are cited in Statistics Canada surveys as the most time-stressed segment of the population.

In addition, the July 1998 GPI report drew attention to the growing phenomenon of “involuntary voluntary work”. Youth, unable to find paid employment, are doing more voluntary work to enhance their job resumes and improve their work skills. The report recommended that future surveys assess this trend in the same way that current market employment surveys estimate involuntary part-time work, by asking whether the reason for voluntary activity was inability to find a job. Though voluntary work may provide useful job training and serve as an investment in human capital, “genuine progress” in the long-term might better be served by these “involuntary volunteers” finding paid employment.


Since the GPI report was released, Statistics Canada has published the results of its 1997 National Survey of Giving, Volunteering and Participating, entitled *Caring Canadians, Involved Canadians* (Statistics Canada catalogue no. 71-542-XPE). GPI Atlantic welcomes this important study which helps to further our knowledge and understanding of this important sector of the economy and to foster the necessary recognition and support of vital voluntary services on which society depends. The 1997 survey updated the 1987 National Survey on Volunteer Activity in Canada, and provides the first ever time series on trends in formal volunteer activity in this country. These trends will be examined in section 4 below.

Unfortunately the survey results are not strictly comparable to those in the GPI report, since they count only formal volunteer hours offered through registered organizations, while the GPI data include “informal” voluntary work, which is help and support given directly by individuals without going through any formal organization. The GPI data are based on the 1992 Statistics Canada General Social Survey (GSS), which counts both formal and informal voluntary work and which will be updated in 1999 with the release of the 1998 General Social Survey results. Next year, therefore, it will be possible to assess trends in the GPI data and to determine whether total voluntary work has been increasing or decreasing.

Although the GPI report used the National Survey on Volunteer Activity for data on attitudes and motivations of volunteers, on out-of-pocket expenses of volunteers, and on indirect contributions to the economy through skills training, it relied primarily on the GSS data for two reasons:

1) First, about twice as much voluntary activity, especially helping the elderly, sick and disabled, takes place informally as through non-profit organizations. Informal voluntary activity is particularly important in the Maritimes in providing critical social services to the community, with the three Maritime provinces ranking as the top three in the country in informal volunteer participation rates. This explains why,
although the Prairie provinces have slightly higher rates of formal volunteer participation, Nova Scotia ranked first when both formal and informal voluntary work were considered in the 1992 GSS.

2) Second, Statistics Canada’s General Social Survey employs time diaries, which are considered the most accurate and objective method of collecting time use data, and which ensure that overlapping activities are not double-counted. The volunteer surveys, by contrast, are based on questionnaires.

5. Alarming Trends

Despite these methodological differences, the new Statistics Canada survey reveals some alarming trends which are predicted in the July 1998 GPI report. While more Canadians than ever are volunteering, they are giving less time than before, evidence of the time squeeze described earlier.

In Canada, formal volunteer hours per capita have dropped by 4.7% since 1987, and in Nova Scotia by 7.2%. What this means, in effect, is that young people, the elderly, the sick and the disabled are receiving less volunteer services per capita than 10 years ago. When volunteer hours are mapped against the growing percentage of elderly people in the population, the drop in volunteer services to the elderly may be as high as 15% in Nova Scotia and 17% nationwide. While more Nova Scotians volunteered in 1997 than in 1987, the average annual hours contributed per volunteer declined from 188 to 141, a drop of 25%.1 (See Table 1 and Charts 1 and 2).

If voluntary work had continued to be offered through community based organizations at the same rate as 10 years ago, Nova Scotians would have received the benefits of 4.3 million additional hours of voluntary services in 1997, and Canadians would have received 110.2 million more hours than they actually did. This decline cost Nova Scotia $60 million and Canada $1.83 billion in lost formal volunteer services in 1997.2 Because

---


2 Monetary values are derived using Statistics Canada’s replacement cost (specialist) imputation for volunteer work, in Statistics Canada, Households’ Unpaid Work: Measurement and Valuation, catalogue no. 13-603E, no. 3, Table A.4, page 71, adjusted to 1997 dollars. For monetary valuation methodology, see GPI Atlantic, The Economic Value of Civic and Voluntary Work in Nova Scotia, Halifax, July, 1998, sections 5.2, pages 17-20, 7.2, pages 34-36 and 7.3, page 37. Since university graduates have a disproportionately high rate of contribution to volunteer organizations - (73% of Nova Scotian university graduates contribute unpaid services to voluntary organizations in the province), - the opportunity cost method of valuation is likely to yield a considerably higher value than the replacement cost method used here. The figure of $60 million for the province can therefore be regarded as a conservative estimate. About 7% of the total represents out-of-pocket expenses by volunteers (see GPI Atlantic, op. cit., section 7.3), with the remainder representing the actual hourly value of the voluntary work performed.

Lost service hours are computed by first assuming the same rate of volunteer participation and annual hours per volunteer in 1997 as in 1987, and then subtracting the actual total volunteer hours as reported in Statistics Canada’s 1997 National Survey of Giving, Volunteering and Participating (catalogue no. 71-542-
voluntary work is not measured in the conventional economic accounts, this loss does not show up in the GDP or in any other market statistics, and is presented here for the first time.

The first data on trends in both formal and informal voluntary work since 1992 will be available later this year with the publication of results from Statistics Canada’s 1998 General Social Survey, and will allow the results presented here to be tested. This will be particularly significant for the Maritime provinces where informal voluntary work has traditionally played a greater role than in the rest of the country. As noted in the July 1998, GPI Atlantic report, Nova Scotia has had the highest rate of volunteering in the country when all forms of voluntary work are considered. It will be interesting to find out whether the informal sector has compensated for the decline in formal voluntary hours.


The decline in formal volunteer hours has occurred at the same time as major cuts in government services to the same vulnerable groups who are dependent on voluntary services. If the one-third cut in annual federal transfer payments to the provinces for health and social services is taken as a proxy for service losses at the government level, then the actual total decline in services to these vulnerable groups is very steep indeed.3 The policy implications of this combined loss are discussed in section 6 below.

At least a portion of the decline in government services is reflected in reduced income supports and social service expenditures. These expenditures rose until 1993 and have fallen steadily since then. Since 1993, per capita government transfers to individuals have fallen by 4%; per capita provincial expenditures on social services have fallen by 17.5%, and per capita municipal government social service spending by 12% (Table 2).4

The decline in transfers should also be measured in relation to the 3% drop in real earnings since 1993. Average real earnings have actually fallen by 6.5% since 1987 and by nearly 10% since 1976, but until 1993, increased government transfer payments

---

3 Maclean’s, July 1, 1996, notes the loss as one-third of the $17 billion in annual transfer payments to the provinces between 1996 and 1998. The Globe and Mail, March 8, 1996, notes that federal cash transfers to Nova Scotia will be reduced from $625 million in 1996-97 to $377 million in 2001, a loss of 40%.

partially compensated for the loss of wages. It is only since 1993 that both earnings and income supports have declined. The average loss of earnings for all Nova Scotians actually masks far greater disparities, with the poorest 40% of Nova Scotian families experiencing a 23% decline in real income after tax since 1987, compared to an 8% decline for the wealthiest 40%.

The combined effects of declining earnings and income supports, substantial cuts in government social services, and the loss of volunteer services, have together produced a serious erosion in the standard of living and quality of life of vulnerable groups in Nova Scotia and throughout Canada. Even excluding reductions in government spending on health care (which affects the elderly and disabled) and cuts in education funding (affecting the young), the combined loss of government and volunteer social services and supports in the last five years is estimated at nearly 30%.

This is the first known documentation of this combined loss and challenges the prevailing assumption that volunteer services have been able to compensate for cuts in government services. Given the dramatic decline in real incomes for poor Nova Scotians, this substantial loss of government and volunteer services indicates that the “social safety net” is no longer operable for many vulnerable groups and individuals.

This gradual erosion of income and services helps explain the steady rise in child poverty levels, increased dependence on food banks, and higher levels of demand experienced by voluntary groups and community-based agencies. A study of 24 community-based non-profit social service agencies in the Halifax Metro area, released last year, concluded: “…The repercussion from changes in health care, social assistance and employment programs to the agencies and their clients was overwhelming”. It summed up agency responses as: “More requests for services; less ability to serve.”

### 7. Why the Decline in Volunteer Hours?

With the steady decline in real incomes through the 1990s, many people are putting in longer hours for pay to make ends meet. In Nova Scotia, personal disposable income per capita has declined by 8% since 1988, matching the 7% drop in per capita formal

---

5 Average weekly earnings, including overtime, Nova Scotia industrial aggregate, from Statistics Canada, CANSIM database 4330, L64926. All percentages are based on 1997 inflation-adjusted constant dollars, using the Consumer Price Index.


volunteer hours.\(^8\) Since the employment rate in 1997 was identical to that in 1987 (52.8% in both years), the decline in volunteer hours cannot be explained by an increase in paid employment.\(^9\)

The percentage of university graduates working for volunteer organizations in Nova Scotia has actually risen from 60% in 1987 to 73% in 1997, by far the highest rate in Canada, and nearly double the participation rate of those with only a high school diploma. But university graduates also have more than double the overtime participation rate of high school graduates, which may help explain the overall per capita decline in volunteer hours contributed. Statistics Canada notes that “the propensity to work overtime rises with an employee’s educational attainment”.\(^10\) As firms and government downsize and fewer workers try to maintain previous output levels, increasing amounts of often unpaid overtime are frequently expected from the most skilled and highly educated workers as the price of job retention.

In addition, as noted in the July, 1998, GPI Atlantic report, married women have particularly high rates of participation in voluntary groups, but are also cited in Statistics Canada surveys as the most “time-stressed” segment of the population as they increasingly struggle to balance work and family responsibilities. In the last 35 years, married mothers with infants have more than doubled their rate of labour force participation, from 25% in 1961 to 62.3% in 1995.\(^11\) One Statistics Canada study reports that “one out of three full-time employed, married mothers suffered from extreme levels of time stress,” as measured by positive responses to seven out of ten questions on time perceptions, and fully 70% “felt rushed on a daily basis.”\(^12\)

Work and time pressures appear to be squeezing out voluntary work time, which is not measured in any of the standard economic accounts. Because these accounts only keep track of market statistics, the decline in voluntary services is invisible in the policy arena, the media and in public perceptions, and only shows up many years later in a subtle decline in the quality of life. This is one reason why the Genuine Progress Index explicitly values voluntary work, and why annual time use surveys are necessary to keep track of these important trends.

---

\(^8\) Personal disposable income from Statistics Canada, CANSIM database 5091, D43232; volunteer hours from Statistics Canada, Caring Canadians Involved Canadians, catalogue no. 71-542-XPE, page 59


\(^10\) Volunteer participation rates among university graduates from Statistics Canada, Caring Canadians, page 59; overtime rates from Statistics Canada, Perspectives on Labour and Income, winter, 1997, catalogue no. 75-001-XPE, especially, pages 5, 6, 13, 14, and 27.


8. Trends in “involuntary voluntary work”

The July report drew attention to the growing phenomenon of involuntary voluntary work, particularly among young people, who are forced to work for free because they cannot find paid work. The 1997 Statistics Canada survey confirms this trend by showing that higher rates of voluntary work among 15 to 24 year-olds are correlated with higher youth unemployment rates.

Between 1987 and 1997 youth volunteer participation rates nearly doubled, increasing by 15 percentage points, compared to only 4.6 percentage points for the population as a whole, though youth volunteers spent about 28% less time on average volunteering in 1997 than they did in 1987. In Nova Scotia 43% of 15 to 24-year-olds worked for volunteer organizations in 1997.13

The Statistics Canada survey notes:

Youth volunteers appear to have different motivations for volunteering than do volunteers in general. They are particularly likely to volunteer to improve job opportunities (54%), to explore their own abilities (68%), and to use their skills and abilities (82%).14

By comparison, only 21% of 25 to 44-year-olds and 11% of 45 to 64-year-olds said their motivation for volunteering was to improve their job opportunities (Chart 3). Among the older groups “helping others” is the most frequently cited reason given for volunteering.15

“Will an elderly person or invalid feel comfortable knowing that the person attending to them is only there because they are required to be?” asks a Maclean’s magazine article on workfare in Ontario.16 A similar question might be asked about volunteers whose primary motivation is enhancing their job prospects. Where affective and emotional ties to vulnerable individuals are a major component of voluntary service, some agencies have expressed concern that unemployed youth volunteering for work experience may leave suddenly as soon as paid work is offered.17

9. Policy Implications

An assumption behind cuts in government services has been that the voluntary sector will pick up the slack and compensate for the losses at the governmental level. Finance Minister, Paul Martin, himself said:

---

13 Statistics Canada, Caring Canadians, pages 40 and 59.
16 Maclean’s, July 1, 1996, page 41.
17 Such views were expressed at a Metro Community Services Network forum on voluntary work at the Captain William Spry Community Centre, October 21, 1998.
There is no question that governments have to rely on volunteerism more than ever in a time of cut-backs, and that makes it absolutely essential that we do all we can to recognize the importance of volunteers.

And Health Minister, David Dingwall, remarked:

*Governments have only woken up in recent years and started to acknowledge the significant contributions that volunteers make*.\(^{18}\)

But without a system of tracking volunteer hours on a regular basis, there has been no way of determining whether the voluntary sector has or has not been able to compensate for the loss of government services. This analysis of the recent Statistics Canada survey is the first direct evidence that it has not been able to do so, and that volunteer hours have in fact declined along with real incomes, transfer payments and government cut-backs in services. This double loss means that vulnerable groups are receiving substantially less support now than they were in 1987.

The losses are compounded by cut-backs in financial supports to volunteer and non-profit groups. Organizations catering to disadvantaged groups have traditionally relied on a combination of public and private funds as well as volunteer efforts. But a recent survey of Metro Halifax community-based agencies found that 20 out of 24 had experienced funding cuts in the last seven years, and that many had to cope with multiple cuts from all levels of government, some as high as 50%.\(^{19}\) In 1996, the provincial Department of Community Services, for example, implemented an across-the-board 3% funding cut to community-based agencies retroactive to April of that year. Since the cut came six months into the fiscal year and affected money already spent, it amounted to an effective 6% reduction in funds.

At the federal level, there were drastic single year budget cuts to many voluntary organizations and community-based agencies, including a 15% cut to the National Anti-Poverty Organization, a 50% cut to the National Voluntary Organization, and a 15% cut to the Canadian Council for International Cooperation. Many cuts have been steady and cumulative. The Canadian Ethnocultural Council was cut 10% in one year, but 40% over five years. The National Action Committee on the Status of Women lost 55% of its federal funding over five years.\(^{20}\)

According to *Maclean’s*,

*One of the great dilemmas is that Canadian governments are cutting spending and support programs precisely at a time when many people need them more than ever…. Governments will have to remember to not just ask what volunteers can do instead of them – but also what they can do to help volunteers.*\(^{21}\)

---


\(^{21}\) *Maclean’s*, op. cit., pages 40, 41
The Canadian Council on Social Development argues:

*Devolving responsibilities for social programs to communities is commonly portrayed as being responsive to local needs. All too often, however, it is done without a corresponding transfer of resources and without recognizing the varying capacities of communities to take on these responsibilities.*

22

The recent Halifax survey of community-based agencies stated that volunteer organizations are “under siege from increased demands for services while struggling with dwindling resources.”

23 Agencies reported that more individuals and families were poorer than seven years earlier and that “the women we see are in poorer mental and physical health than they used to be.”

24

The growing need for services and the increasing vulnerability of disadvantaged groups is largely due to the fall in real incomes, particularly for the least well off segments of society. Income after tax and transfers fell by 25% in constant dollars for the poorest 20% of Nova Scotian families between 1985 and 1996. Between 1988 and 1996, the second poorest 20% experienced a similar loss of real income.

25

In sum, funding cuts to volunteer organizations and community agencies, and the actual decline in volunteer hours per capita, documented for the first time, indicate that the voluntary sector has been unable to meet the growing demands for its services. Despite government recognition of the importance of voluntary services at a time of fiscal and budgetary restraint, the invisibility of the voluntary sector in our conventional accounting system has left assumptions about community takeovers of government services untested. An annual time use survey is the minimum data requirement to track the health of the voluntary sector.

By regularly measuring and valuing voluntary work, and thus recognizing its economic and social importance, the Genuine Progress Index can help raise the profile of the voluntary sector and bring it more directly into the policy arena. Financial and other supports for volunteer organizations are necessary to protect this powerful provincial asset, and to ensure the maintenance of vital services that contribute directly to our quality of life and standard of living. In addition, the recognition that market trends like increased overtime hours and time pressures may squeeze out important voluntary work, can focus policy attention on critical links between the paid and unpaid sectors of the economy. Explicitly valuing unpaid work can help afford the voluntary sector the policy attention it deserves.


Appendix: Tables and Charts

Table 1: More Volunteers with Less Time to Give Has Meant a Net Loss of Volunteer Services to Canadians
(Informal volunteer organizations, 1987-1997)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of volunteers (thousands)</th>
<th>Total annual volunteer hours (thousands)</th>
<th>Average annual hours per volunteer</th>
<th>Volunteer service hours per capita (total population)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>5,337</td>
<td>7,472</td>
<td>1,017,548</td>
<td>1,108,924</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nfld.</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>22,600</td>
<td>20,494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEI</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>4,669</td>
<td>4,869</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.S.</td>
<td>218</td>
<td>283</td>
<td>40,901</td>
<td>40,029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.B.</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>34,097</td>
<td>34,121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td>1,005</td>
<td>1,313</td>
<td>206,911</td>
<td>196,974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>1,870</td>
<td>2,890</td>
<td>352,923</td>
<td>421,596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>344</td>
<td>48,748</td>
<td>44,763</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sask.</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>50,497</td>
<td>48,311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>701</td>
<td>878</td>
<td>121,035</td>
<td>128,323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.C.</td>
<td>661</td>
<td>1,005</td>
<td>135,166</td>
<td>169,443</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOTE: Figures do not include informal voluntary work, for which trends will be available with the 1999 release of the 1998 General Social Survey results.

Sources:
David Ross, Economic Dimensions of Volunteer Work in Canada, Department of the Secretary of State of Canada, January 1990, page 11;
Statistics Canada, Giving Freely: Volunteers in Canada, by Doreen Duchesne, catalogue no. 71-535, no. 4;
Statistics Canada, Quarterly Demographic Statistics, July-September, 1997, catalogue no. 91-002-XPB, volume 11, no. 3, page 16;
Chart 1: Time Squeeze on Volunteers: Annual Hours per Volunteer, 1987 - 1997

Chart 2: Decline in Volunteer Service Hours, 1987 - 1997
Table 2: Decline in per capita Government Expenditures on Social Services and Income Support, and in Real Wages, Nova Scotia, 1993-1997
(Constant 1997 dollars)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Government transfers to persons</th>
<th>Provincial government expenditures on social services</th>
<th>Municipal government expenditures on social services</th>
<th>Average weekly earnings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>$3,817</td>
<td>$1,740</td>
<td>$356</td>
<td>$520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>$3,769</td>
<td>$1,599</td>
<td>$349</td>
<td>$520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>$3,680</td>
<td>$1,563</td>
<td>$308</td>
<td>$511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>$3,624</td>
<td>$1,536</td>
<td>$314</td>
<td>$509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997*</td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>$1,435</td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>$504</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- 1997 figures for columns 1 and 3 were not available at publication time.
- Government expenditures in columns 1, 2 and 3 are averaged over the whole Nova Scotia population.

Chart 3: Percentage of Volunteers Whose Motivation is to Increase Job Prospects